

**ATHENS-CLARKE COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**

APPLICATION NUMBER..... COA-2025-11-2328
DATE..... December 17, 2025
PETITIONER..... Carl Myers
REQUEST..... Partial Demolition and Rear Addition
LOCATION..... 163 Mell Street
PROPERTY INFORMATION.....Tax Parcel # 171A1 C006, Bloomfield, RS-8
RECOMMENDATION..... Approval with Conditions

REQUEST

Approval is requested to add a rear addition and dormer and modify select window openings.

BACKGROUND

Parcel Status: The property is considered a contributing resource to the Bloomfield Historic District. This means that changes are reviewed for the impact to the overall district as well as to the character of this property.

Parcel History: Several previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness are on file for this property. Modifications to a previous addition were approved in 2001 and 2005. An accessory building in 2004, modification of openings to the original rear porch enclosure in 2004 and a handrail in 2010. Sanborn Maps for the area show that this structure was built by 1913 when the mapping first included this area. A rear addition was added between 1964 and 1978 based on aerial photography.

Lot Features: The subject property is located on the eastern side of Mell Street and mid-block between Cloverhurst Avenue and Rutherford Street. The parcel has around 136' of lot width and about 168 feet of lot depth with an alley at the rear. The topography of the property sees a drop of about six feet from the front north corner of the parcel to the rear.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Rear Addition Demolition: The existing conditions include a rear addition that was made between 1964 and 1978 that extends to the right (south) side. Note that the submitted as-built drawings are not accurate to this addition. It is shown as having a gable roofline when it is actually a single slope down to the rear with some discrepancies in window openings as well. This rear addition was the subject of modifications following COA approvals in 2001 and 2005.

The demolition would also include an enclosed rear porch area at the north end of the structure. This porch is shown on the Sanborn Maps including the earliest map of 1913. It is unclear when the porch was enclosed, but the enclosure details were modified by a 2004 COA.

Rear Addition: The proposed rear addition would include a narrow addition to the side of the historic structure on the southern side. This would bump out the enclosed area by about 2' and be even with the amount of extension that the wrap porch has at this side. This area would have same roof slope but be extending from a higher point. This would conceal an existing paired casement window opening. This

window opening has a lower head height than the others on this wall and has a corner board to its east and west suggesting that this could have been a recessed entry or porch at one point. The new wall plane would be west of that corner board meaning that it too would be obscured by the proposed addition. The depth of this 2' bumpout would extend the full depth of the historic house massing (about 11') and then beyond by about 14 additional feet. This depth would be about 10' less than that of the existing rear addition to be removed. An addition 2 feet extension is seen at a recessed bay from this southeast rear corner.

The rear elevation of the addition would have a varied building line. As mentioned, a 2' extension bumps out from the main massing. A covered rear porch would slightly recessed from the small extension with the porch recessing about 15 feet. Another gable extension would be on the north end. It would maintain the 3' recess from the northeast corner of the historic structure that the existing historic porch has but it would extend out 16' compared to the 8' of that existing rear porch.

Openings on this new addition would include:

Right Side (South): Re-use of the paired casement window from the area being covered at approximately the same position on the new wall. This would be the only opening on the 25' length of wall.

Rear (East): The rear elevation would include a paired casement or slider opening at the full width of the small bump-out and a bank of four windows at the new gable extension on the north end. The recessed rear porch would have two sets of double doors as the only openings.

Left side (North): A bank of three windows would be just west of centered on this side of the addition. Two sets of paired windows on the adjacent portion of the historic house are shown as being eliminated on the elevation drawings. However, the floorplan suggests a bank of three windows being used.

Materials would include:

Roofing: Asphalt Architectural Shingles are the existing roofing material. The drawings suggest shingles are proposed for the new addition areas but confirmation is needed as the application only states that the new roofing is to be "compatible".

Siding and Trim: The existing structure has painted wood shingled as the siding at the front porch and as accents to the wood lap siding on the primary wall planes. Matching wood siding of the same profile and exposure is proposed for the new addition with matching trim. Note that the drawings suggest shingle siding.

Windows: The new windows are to be made of wood or "compatible". The windows are shown as mostly double-hung with one-over-one sash. However, one paired single sash window is shown on the rear. It is unclear if these are casements, sliders, or fixed sash.

Doors: No material or description is provided beyond "historically styled and scaled". The elevation drawing reflects the two sets of paired doors at the rear porch to be full light with eight panes per door.

Foundation: It is noted that the new foundation is to be "visually consistent with historic foundation height and material". The elevation drawings do not depict a foundation with the shingle siding shown extending to grade. Due to extensive plantings, it is not readily apparent what the existing foundation conditions area.

Site Changes: Site changes are shown on the comparison of the existing and proposed site plans but are not described in the application materials. Depicted is a new straight driveway to be shifted north of the existing and about two feet from the wall plane of the wrap porch and proposed new side addition area. This drive would extend to the rear of the structure to a parking pad just east of the proposed rear addition. The driveway is shown as no longer connecting with the rear alley. Materials for the driveway

and parking area are unclear. The existing driveway is asphalt, transitioning to concrete for the parking area and connecting with the gravel alley.

The existing ramp at the south side of the front porch would be removed as would the ramp at the rear leading from the parking area to the rear deck.

REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION:

Review of this application would follow the general set of Design Guidelines including Chapter 2 regarding the Building Materials and Features, Chapter 3 on Site Materials and Features, Chapter 4 on additions as New Construction, and Chapter 5 on Demolition.

	Met?	Comments
2B: Windows	Unclear	Changes to the window openings at the east end of the north side elevation appear to be planned. Details of the change are not provided in the application materials and are conflicted on the elevation and floorplan. It appears that the existing two sets of paired windows are already counter height. Additional information is needed on the integrity of the existing openings and the planned changes to assess the compatibility of the design.
3A Parking, Drives, & Walkways	Unclear	The historic aerial photos on file appear to show the existing curb cut location to have been consistent with the driveway as early as 1946. However, the driveway appears to have angled to extend along the side of the house with the modification to the current conditions happening around the 1980s. Additional information is needed on the materials proposed and the potential to maintain the existing curb cut.
4F: Additions as New Construction <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scale & Massing • Placement & Orientation • Materials • Details 	Mixed	The scale of the proposed addition is subordinate to the existing structure with a massing that breaks the addition into separate areas. This positively impacts the scale and is consistent the varied roofline of the historic structure. The extension of the addition to add two feet of width along a portion of the historic structure on the southern side obscures an opening and an understanding of the historic massing at this southeast rear corner. The orientation of the structure would be unchanged with this request. Detailed material information has not been submitted. Where noted, the materials appear to match those used historically. This matching materiality necessitates clear massing of the addition to be sure that it is distinct from the historic. Additional material information is also needed for several areas of the design. Details of the addition design include banks of windows at the northeast portion of the addition. Banks of windows are currently found at the north side of the historic structure with a bank of four smaller double hung windows at a bay under the dormer on that side. Paired openings are currently found at the side dormers, the eastern end of the north elevation and the non-historic addition. Corner boards appear to be suggested on the elevations, though these are not typical at areas of shingle siding. The existing brackets at the rear gable of the house

		are not shown, it is unclear if removal of this detail is planned. Removal would not be appropriate.
5: Demolition	Yes	The removal of the non-historic addition is appropriate. It does not add to the character or significance of the property. The removal of the enclosed rear porch does impact a historic portion of the structure, in place by 1913. The rear porch has preserved the original shape of the openings in its enclosure. These are consistent with the shapes found on the front porch. This historic area does add to the architectural significance to a modest degree but is not of great importance to the character of the district.

Staff finds that the proposed changes to the property are largely appropriate with conditions to address the concerns noted above:

- The existing windows at the eastern end of the north elevation be retained unless evidence of this not being the historic condition can be provided for staff review.
- The existing curb cut location be retained with the drive allowed to angle to nearly abut the southern side of the house as per the historic conditions. Driveway materials to be confirmed for compatibility by staff.
- The new addition is to not include the 2' extension at the south side over the existing historic structure. An extension of 2' be allowed to begin at or behind the rear corner with corner boards retained. This distinct massing will allow for matching building materials as proposed.
- The use of any materials not fully consistent with the existing conditions be specified to staff for compatibility.
- All existing gable brackets and other details on the historic structure be retained.

This recommendation is made to address the design guidelines noted above, as well as Section 8-5-5 D (1) of the Athens-Clarke County Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Acceptable Historic Preservation Commission Reaction to an Application for Certificate of Appropriateness.

REPORT FOR:		163 Mell Street
In evaluating the attached report, the following standards, which are checked, were considered in making a recommendation. Items that are not applicable are marked as such. More detailed descriptions of each item are included in the attached report.		
REVIEWED	NOT APPLICABLE	
X		1. HISTORIC USES OF PROPERTY
X		2. NECESSITY OF PROPOSED CHANGES
X		3. INTEGRITY OF HISTORIC RESOURCE
		4. THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE CHANGE WILL AFFECT:
X		A. INTEGRITY OF THE BUILDING
X		B. INTEGRITY OF THE AREA
X		5. ORIGINAL AND CURRENT USES

163 Mell St. Review Worksheet

	Met?	Comments
2B: Windows		
3A Parking, Drives, & Walkways		
4F: Additions as New Construction <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scale & Massing • Placement & Orientation • Materials • Details 		
5: Demolition		